



Implementation of Promotion and Transfer Policies at the Gorontalo City Education and Training Civil Service Agency

Nandar Alfian Gani, Asna Aneta, Fenti Prihatini Tui

Pascasarjana Universitas Negeri Gorontalo

ABSTRACT

The objectives of this study are: 1) To determine the implementation of promotion and transfer policies at the BKPP in Gorontalo City in terms of planning, implementation, and evaluation in promotion and transfer. 2) To identify the factors that determine the implementation of promotion and transfer policies at the BKPP in Gorontalo City in terms of policy standards and objectives, resources, communication, disposition, and bureaucratic structure. The research method used is a qualitative descriptive research method. The research location is the Gorontalo City Civil Service and Education Training Agency, located at Jalan 23 Januari, Biawo Village, South Gorontalo District, Gorontalo City, Gorontalo Province. Data collection techniques include observation, interviews, and documentation, which are then analyzed using qualitative data. The research findings indicate that: 1) The implementation of promotion and transfer policies at the Gorontalo City Civil Service and Education Agency was examined in terms of: a) planning, b) implementation, and c) evaluation. The BKPP of Gorontalo City has not fully implemented promotion and transfer policies, as evidenced by the absence of job competency standards (SKJ) and the lack of an assessment process in Gorontalo City. However, aside from that, the process is proceeding as it should. 2) The factors influencing the implementation of promotion and transfer policies at the Gorontalo City Education and Training Agency were examined from the following aspects: a) communication, b) resources, c) disposition, and d) bureaucratic structure. The Gorontalo City Civil Service and Education Agency has implemented the policy in accordance with the supporting factors, although there are still challenges to be addressed, including the lack of a comprehensive human resource management system () and insufficient budget allocation that cannot be thoroughly accounted for.

Keywords: *Implementation, Promotion and Transfer, Gorontalo City Education and Training Civil Service Agency*

INTRODUCTION

Reforming the civil service is a top priority in public administration reform in many countries, including Indonesia. The demand for improved performance of civil servants is growing, especially in relation to government efforts to enhance the quality of civil service performance. The importance of employee quality cannot be overstated. This is an essential part of the government's mission to achieve national goals and improve the quality of life for its citizens. Studies on government bureaucracy remain intriguing due to the unique conditions and public issues surrounding them.

The development of civil service management aims to create a professional, integrity-driven, and neutral bureaucracy. This process has been underway since the implementation of the merit system in civil service management. Law No. 5 of 2014 on the Civil Service (ASN) serves as the legal foundation, explicitly mandating that government agencies must adopt the merit system in civil service management. The merit system is a policy and management approach for ASN based on qualifications, competencies, and performance, applied fairly and reasonably without discrimination based on political background, race, skin color, religion, origin, gender, marital status, age, or disability.

The need for changes to improve the governance structure for a better future is something the public desires. Civil service management is the area that receives the most attention in this regard. The question is how to ensure that civil servants (ASN) can perform their duties effectively in serving the public. In addressing these challenges, one of the most critical aspects in the functioning of government is the promotion and transfer of civil servants () to ensure they perform their duties effectively. Similarly, the placement of employees in positions that align with their qualifications and expertise is equally important.

(Angraini, 2018) explains that during the process of carrying out tasks by each employee in an institution or government agency, there will inevitably be problems encountered, including by the civil servant performance appraisal team. These problems arise both within the organization and externally. These conditions need to be analyzed within the performance of the civil servant performance evaluation team. Of course, these factors are complex. Internal factors, such as mechanisms and job suitability, influence the weaknesses of the civil servant performance evaluation team.

According to (Winarsih & Ratminto, 2011), "various studies have shown that the implementation of promotions and job transfers in both central and local government agencies has been unclear." The effectiveness of promotion and job transfer is influenced by several other factors, such as political

considerations, regional autonomy, ethnicity, race, and even educational background. Therefore, the placement of civil servants in structural positions is a crucial factor in achieving organizational goals. Errors in the appointment and placement of individuals in certain positions can hinder the smooth operation of government organizations if the principle of "the right person in the right place" is not followed.

The Chairperson of the Civil Service Commission (KASN) in this context, who is responsible for implementing the merit system in Indonesia, stated that Gorontalo City is one of the areas classified in the Yellow Zone for civil service neutrality (Tarmizi, 2022). This could also pose a risk in implementing the merit system, particularly in terms of promotions and transfers. Given the close link between promotions and transfers and civil service neutrality itself, it is crucial to ensure that the merit system is implemented effectively. If we refer to the merit system in terms of promotions and transfers, it should be manifested in the form of objective and transparent policies based on qualifications, competencies, and performance, utilizing a *talent pool*. One such policy is the filling of JPT positions through open selection. Through open selection, it is hoped that the right people will be appointed to positions in accordance with organizational needs, thereby overcoming *spoils system* and job trading, and providing opportunities for all employees to compete. (Rahadiri A, 2022)

Based on the Gorontalo City Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMD) 2019-2024, efforts to ensure the achievement of short-term, medium-term, and long-term development targets are to improve the quality of governance. The RPJMD of Gorontalo City also commits to promoting the implementation of bureaucratic reform based on the Bureaucratic Reform Roadmap, which has been established as a guideline for the government and all relevant agencies in developing their action plans.

The objectives of job promotion as stated by Hasibuan (2009:113) include: 1. To provide recognition, positions, and greater rewards to employees with high work performance. 2. To foster personal satisfaction and pride, higher social status, and increased income. 3. To motivate employees to work with greater enthusiasm, maintain high discipline, and enhance their productivity. To ensure workforce stability through promotions based on merit, at the appropriate time, and through honest and fair evaluations. According to Malayu S. P. Hasibuan (2008), the implementation of transfers in the Merit System is the relocation of employees based on scientific, objective criteria, and their work performance. This merit system is a good basis for transfers because it leads to increased output and productivity, improved work morale, reduced errors, better employee attendance, improved employee discipline (), and a decrease in accidents.

Based on the explanation above, it can be assumed that the promotions and transfers that have been carried out cannot yet be considered satisfactory. With the delay in promotions and transfers, other matters related to the government's objectives are also hindered. Especially when looking at the data in Table 1.1, from 2021 to 2023, there has been a decrease in the number of promotions and transfers in the city of Gorontalo, which means that the renewal and improvement of the government system have not been optimally implemented. Therefore, in conducting a more in-depth analysis of the implementation of the merit system in promotions and transfers at the BKPP of Gorontalo City, it is essential to utilize the regulations set forth in the Mayor's Regulation No. 34 of 2022, which emphasizes the use of an objective and transparent merit system.

From the above description, there are several obstacles in terms of promotion and transfer. Looking at the transfer and promotion process from 2021 to 2023, there has been a decline. In this context, referring to Regulation No. 34 of 2022 on the Objectives of Promotion and Transfer to ensure the continuity of local government performance through transfers and promotions, the researcher is interested in further examining and studying this issue with the title **"Implementation of Policies in Promotion and Transfer at the BKPP City of Gorontalo"**

RESEARCH METHODS

The research method used is qualitative descriptive research. According to Sugiyono (2009:29), the descriptive method with qualitative analysis is a method that serves to describe or provide an overview of conclusions that apply to the general public. This means that the research aims to obtain an overview and understanding of the implementation of promotion and transfer policies at the BKPP in Gorontalo City based on the issues discussed.

RESEARCH FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

1. Implementation of Promotion and Transfer Policies at the BKPP of Gorontalo City

a. Planning

The research findings indicate that the planning stage can be briefly outlined as follows: the BKPP of Gorontalo City formulates, discusses, and establishes plans for promotion and transfer in an uncertain manner in the planning stage (). However, in the implementation stage, the BKPP of Gorontalo City outlines the plans in a simple manner and follows the existing regulations, namely Government Regulation No. 11 of 2017.

The planning process begins with the foundation of Law No. 5 of 2014 and the Merit System Guidelines in Ministerial Regulation No. 40 of 2018, Government Regulation No. 11 of 2017, and Municipal Regulation No. 34 of 2022, which stipulate that promotions must be based on standards of classification, competence, and performance. For senior leadership positions, promotions are directly assigned and evaluated by the Selection Committee (Pansel) based on job classification, performance records, competencies, and managerial competencies. As a result, the City Training and Education Center (BKPP) of Gorontalo only provides recommendations for names and fully delegates the responsibility for selection to the Performance Evaluation Team. These standards apply not only to senior leadership positions but also to administrative and functional positions. Senior leadership positions are exempted because there are no established competency standards for managerial roles in Gorontalo. Therefore, the Regional XI BKN in Manado is

utilized based on the data and reports from the BKPP of Gorontalo City to conduct the selection process for managerial competencies. For transfers, prior to the transfer request, the BKPP of Gorontalo City requires the relevant individual to submit three mandatory letters: approval from the receiving OPD, and if approved, the letter must be addressed to the applicant and the original OPD. After the receiving OPD provides a response letter, a Job Analysis Letter and a Letter of Recommendation for the issuance of the Transfer Order (SPT) from the receiving OPD are required.

b. Implementation

In the implementation of promotions and transfers, there are two stages. The first stage is open bidding for JPT and the filling of positions determined by the Performance Assessment Team (Kinerja). In this process, everything is decided by the performance assessment team, whether it is a promotion or a transfer. Looking at these stages, the researcher found that promotions and transfers are determined by the regional secretary, who is the highest leader of the performance assessment team. Competency testing may involve filling vacant positions and rotating transfers among JPT positions of the same rank, specifically for rank 2. For open selection of Level 3 officials promoted to Level 2, competency assessments or evaluations of JPT must be conducted at least 5 years and no sooner than 2 years after the previous assessment, followed by another competency assessment. This planning document is submitted to the Civil Service Commission (KASN) and will be published for recommendation in the selection process.

Promotion to JPT must be carried out by fulfilling the job requirements through an open selection process and based on the merit system, taking into account the needs of the organization. Senior officials at the central and regional levels may be transferred vertically. Such transfers are carried out through an open selection process in accordance with qualifications, competencies, and job requirements, taking into account the needs of the organization, while promotion within JA is carried out through internal selection and submitted to the PPK. For JF promotions within the JF group, promotions are made in cases of JF rank advancement, in accordance with applicable laws and regulations. In cases of rank advancement for Functional Officials, they may transfer from the lowest rank to the highest rank within their respective JF category.

Furthermore, several obstacles in the promotion and transfer process found by the researchers were the absence of job competency standards, competency standards for the position, and competency standards for the person, the number of training sessions and educational specifications. In interviews, the researchers also found an explanation that due to the absence of job competency standards, there were cases of people filling positions first and then attending training.

c. assessment

The stages of assessment in the promotion and transfer evaluation process at the BKPP of Gorontalo City are based on the criteria for promotion and transfer evaluation, which refer to Government Regulation No. 11 of 2017. This regulation outlines the requirements for administrative and supervisory positions. Since there is no Job Competency Requirements (SKJ) in place, the evaluation is based on general provisions. The requirements include a minimum educational qualification of D4, good performance over the past two years, and good physical and mental health. These are requirements that everyone can meet, except for the specific educational qualification. Since there is no reference in this area, namely the SKJ, we cannot proceed further. Therefore, all cases are referred to the Personnel Selection Committee (PPK) to select candidates who meet the criteria by attaching the relevant data. Three candidates who meet the criteria will be further screened by the PPK, who will review the employees' work records and conduct an assessment to determine their suitability for a specific position.

Job standards refer to job competency standards, because the SKJ (Job Competency Standards) for each position are different. For example, position A must undergo training, based on their rank, track record, and disciplinary sanctions. Furthermore, the BKPP of Gorontalo City only recommends the top three names that meet the criteria. The final decision on whether to select the first, second, or third candidate will depend on the considerations made by the PPK (Civil Service Development Officer). The PPK consists of the Inspectorate, the Human Resources Department, the Secretary of the City Government, and several academics.

Referring to Government Regulation No. 11 of 2017 on Civil Service Management, it can be observed that the evaluation process for promotion and transfer is less transparent and cannot be considered objective. This is evident from statements made by several sources indicating that the Gorontalo City Civil Service Agency (BKPP) has not yet established Job Competency Standards (SKJ), which also impacts the ability to occupy certain positions.

2. Factors Influencing the Implementation of Promotion and Transfer Policies at the BKPP of Gorontalo City

a. Communication

In terms of communication, the implementation of promotion and transfer policies carried out by the BKPP of Gorontalo City has been understood by employees. However, because these policies are passive in nature and there is no certainty as to when they will be implemented, responsibility has been delegated entirely to the regional government. Consistent information fosters collaboration to support the smooth implementation of merit-based policies in promotions and transfers. However, the communication established has been less than optimal because it is carried out passively in the implementation of the policies. This has resulted in the merit-based system not being fully understood by most employees, with only a few able to grasp it. Despite the existence of the Civil Service Information System, research findings indicate that some employees have not filled out their performance reports when their data is to be entered into the promotion and transfer process. This poses a challenge for promotions and transfers.

b. Resources

The second dimension is the resource factor, because in a policy, resources greatly influence policy implementation. Without resources, a policy is nothing more than a pile of documents. In promoting merit-based transfers in the BKPP of Gorontalo City, resources, infrastructure, budgeting, and information

resources are inseparable factors in policy implementation. The BKPP of Gorontalo City still lacks the capacity to take over the selection process (JPT) Senior Leadership Positions because it still relies on resources and infrastructure from Regional XI BKN in Manado for managerial and socio-cultural competency selection, specifically managerial competency and socio-cultural competency assessments conducted using the Assessment Center method by assessors at the Regional XI BKN Office in Manado. However, all other processes are carried out in Gorontalo City.

c. Disposition

The results of the research conducted by the BKPP of Gorontalo City in implementing the merit system for promotions and transfers have been very good, as evidenced by the implementation process, although there are still some areas that need improvement. These include the assessment team, which should be from the BKN in Manado, and the data section within the BKPP of Gorontalo City, which currently has only one staff member. This has resulted in an excessive workload for that section. However, overall, the process has been carried out smoothly. In November, the swearing-in ceremony for civil servants was held, with 51 civil servants being sworn in from rank III A to III B. The implementation of the promotion and transfer process was carried out smoothly. During the interviews, it was also found that some civil servants who were targeted for promotion did not accept the promotion, while others did not receive it but the issue resolved itself. The main reasons why certain individuals were not promoted were explained in detail.

d. Bureaucratic structure

The BKPP of Gorontalo City has maximized the implementation of the merit system in promotions and transfers, as seen from the bureaucratic perspective. where promotions and transfers within the merit system begin with data collection or mapping, the results of which are submitted to the State Civil Apparatus Commission (KASN) for promotion or transfer recommendations. Additionally, the structured teamwork and coordination have enabled the promotion process to begin in May 2023 and conclude with the swearing-in ceremony in November 2023. This teamwork involves the Gorontalo City BKPP collaborating with the KASN, the Regional XI Office of the National Civil Service Agency in Manado for the Assessment Team, and the PPK Team to implement the merit-based system in promotions and transfers.

Research Findings

First, the implementation process for a specific position lacks standardization, which has become the primary obstacle in implementing the merit system for promotions and transfers at the BKPP in Gorontalo City. According to Permenpan No. 40 of 2017, the merit system must be based on classification, competence, and performance. However, in this case, the BKPP of Gorontalo City does not have any competency standards for a particular position, which has become an obstacle in the implementation of the merit system in promotions and transfers.

Secondly, related to the above, the BKPP of Gorontalo City does not yet have a SKJ. In an interview with the head of the BKPP of Gorontalo City, it was explained that there are several positions that are filled first and then trained. Due to the absence of a SKJ or job competency standards and the fact that they have not been implemented optimally, this measure was taken.

Third, in the implementation of policies on promotion and transfer of civil servants, there are several obstacles faced by implementers, namely, the data department has only one person responsible for overseeing, monitoring, and managing the data of civil servants. Additionally, budget constraints have been highlighted, as mentioned during interviews with the transfer department, where it was stated that the SIM (Civil Service Management Information System) occasionally experiences issues, necessitating manual processes, which in turn leads to cost limitations.

Based on the above description, it can be concluded that the incompleteness of tools in the implementation process of the merit system poses an obstacle in the implementation of policies. The merit system itself should be based on three main points, namely competency classification and performance. Similarly, the system should also facilitate implementers in the implementation of the merit system, but the opposite has occurred. This has become the main obstacle in the delay of the implementation process.

REFERENCES

- Anderson, James, 1979, Policy Making, (Second ed.), New York: Holt,
- AG. Subarsono, Public Policy Analysis (Concepts, Theories, and Applications), Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2004
- Abdul Wahab, Solichin. 2012. Policy Analysis: From Formulation to the Development of Policy Implementation Models. Jakarta: PT. Bumi Aksara
- Adi Suryanto and Mariman Darto 2020. Implementation of merit system policy: best practices in state administrative institutions
- Andi Sefullah A. Muin Fahmal & Muhammad Fachri Said 2020. Implementation of the Merit System in the Management of Civil Servants at the Ministry of Religious Affairs of South Sulawesi.
- Andry Prasetya Permana, Rahmad Taufik 2023. Implementation of Merit Policies and Systems in the Open Selection of Senior Leadership Positions in South Bangka Regency
- Anggita Chariah, Ariski S, Agus Nugroho, and Adi Suhariyant 2020 Implementation of the merit system in the civil service in Indonesia
- Chaizi Nasucha. (2004). Public Administration Reform: Theory and Practice. Jakarta, PT Gramedia Widiasarana Indonesia.
- Dwiyanto, a. (2021). Public bureaucratic reform in Indonesia. Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press.

- Dye, Thomas R. (1981) *Understanding Policy*. Englewood, Cliff: PrenticeHall
- Igirisa, I. (2022). *Public Policy (A Theoretical and Empirical Review)*. Yogyakarta: Tanah Air Beta.
- Kadji, Y. (2015). *Implementation of Public Policy in the Perspective of Reality*. Tulungagung: Cahaya Abadi.
- Keban, Yermias T. (2004). *Six Strategic Dimensions of Public Administration: Concepts, Theories, and Issues*. Yogyakarta: Gava Media
- Mindarti, Lely Indah. 2007. *The Revolution of Public Administration*. Malang: Banyumedia.
- Miftah Thoha. 2008. *Contemporary Public Administration Science*. Jakarta: Kencana.
- Pasolong, Harbani 2013. *Theory of Public Administration: Concepts, Theory, and Issues*. Yogyakarta. Gava Media
- Ritzer, George, and Douglas J. Goodman. 2005. *Modern Sociology Theory*. Jakarta: Prenada.
- Syahruddin. 2018. *Implementation of Public Policy: Concepts, Theories, and Case Studies*. Bandung: Nusa Media
- Sugiyono. 2008. *Understanding Qualitative Research*. CV Alfabeta: Jakarta.
- Sugiyono. 2010. *Educational Research Methods (Quantitative, Qualitative, and R&D Approaches)*. Bandung: Alfabeta
- Sefullah, Andi, A Muin Fahmal, and Muhammad Fachri Said. 2020. "Implementation of the Merit System in the Management of Civil Servants at the Ministry of Religious Affairs of South Sulawesi." *Kalabbirang Law Journal* 2 (1). <http://jurnal.ahmar.id/index.php/kalabbirang30>.
- Shafritz, Jay M., and Russel, E.W. (1997). *Introducing Administration, USA*: Addison – Wesley Educational Publisher Inc.
- Tjilen, 2019, *Concepts, Theories, and Techniques, Analysis of Implementation, Public Policy*, Bandung: Hikam Media Utama
- Tjiptoherijanto, Prijono, and Mandala Manurung. (2010). *Paradigms of Public Administration and Their Development*. Jakarta: University of Indonesia.
- Tarmizi, T. (2022, October 24). KASN Chair: Gorontalo Enters the Yellow Zone for Civil Service Neutrality. Retrieved from [antaranews: /www.antaranews.com/berita/3198973/ketua-kasn-ingatkan-asn-tetap-jaga-netralitas-pada-pemilu-2024](https://www.antaranews.com/berita/3198973/ketua-kasn-ingatkan-asn-tetap-jaga-netralitas-pada-pemilu-2024)
- Tahir, A. (2020). *Public Policy and Transparency in the Implementation of Local Government Transparency*. Bandung: alfabeta.
- White, Leonard D. 1939. *Introduction to the Study of Administration*. Revised Edition. New York: Macmillan
- Wahab, Solichin A. (2008). *Public Policy Analysis: From Formulation to Implementation of State Policy*, Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Waldo Dwight, *The Study of Administration*, Random House, New York, 1963.
- William N Dunn, 1994, *Public Policy Analysis*, Gajah Mada University Press, Yogyakarta
- Winarsih, A. S., & Ratminto. (2011). Development of a Career Planning System for the Klaten Regency Government, Central Java. *Journal of Government Studies*, 3.

DOCUMENTS

- Law No. 5 of 2014 on Civil Servants
- Regulation of the Minister of State Apparatus Empowerment Number 40 of 2018
- Regulation of the Mayor No. 34 of 2022
- Regional Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMD) of Gorontalo Province 2019-2024
- Report on Promotion and Transfer of the City of Gorontalo's Civil Service Agency