



---

## The Translation Evaluation of 'Bhoomkal: Comredon Ke Saath' Translated from English into Hindi

*Premchand Babarao Nagdeote*

Research Scholar Department of Linguistics, Dr. Harisingh Gaur Central University, Sagar, Madhya Pradesh

Email: [premnagdeote@gmail.com](mailto:premnagdeote@gmail.com)

---

### ABSTRACT

This research undertakes a comprehensive evaluation of "Bhoomkal: Comredon ke Saath," the Hindi translation of Arundhati Roy's "Walking with the Comrades," focusing on the translation's efficacy in conveying the original text's socio-political message and literary quality. The study employs a qualitative approach, drawing upon established translation theories and models, including those proposed by Colina, House, and others, to assess the translation's textual and pragmatic dimensions. Specifically, it examines the translator's (Nilabh's) choices regarding word selection, sentence structure, and cultural adaptation, particularly in relation to the complex socio-political context of tribal struggles in central India. The research addresses critical questions concerning the communication of the translated text, its linguistic accuracy, and its resemblance to the source text. It analyzes the translator's handling of technical terminology, cultural nuances, and stylistic elements, considering the challenges posed by the sensitive subject matter and the need for clarity and accessibility for the target audience. Through detailed analysis of practical examples, the study investigates how the translator navigates the linguistic and cultural differences between English and Hindi, focusing on lexical choices, syntactic shifts, and the adaptation of cultural references.

The evaluation aims to determine the extent to which the translated text effectively conveys the urgency, emotions, and vividness of Roy's original account, while maintaining clarity and consistency in addressing complex issues such as tribal land rights, human rights abuses, and the dynamics of the Naxalite movement. The research concludes by assessing the overall quality of the translation, highlighting the translator's strengths and identifying areas for potential improvement, thus contributing to the broader discourse on translation evaluation in the context of socio-political literature.

**Keywords:** Arundhati Roy, Bhoomkal: Comredon ke Saath, Hindi Translation, Cultural Adaptation

---

### Introduction

The current research focuses on the translation evaluation of 'Bhoomkal: Comredon ke Saath,' which is the translated version of 'Walking with the Comrades,' a book originally written by the renowned English author Arundhati Roy. Arundhati Roy's other books are also well-known, and each of them has been translated by someone. In this study, we will evaluate the translation done by Nilabh for 'Bhoomkal: Comredon ke Saath.' Arundhati Roy used technical terminology in his book 'Walking with the Comrades.' this research will assess the translation at both the textual and pragmatic levels, considering aspects such as word choice, sentence structure, and overall meaning."

---

### Review of Literature

**Colina, Sonia** (2015) in his book entitled 'Fundamentals of Translation' discussed the main seven chapters. First are term translation concepts, definitions and usage. It includes translation, translatability and translation studies, preliminary definition: Basic concept, some definition about translation, activity about translation, Types of translation activity, Translation in a professional context, Translation competence, translation skills and the concept of translation. Second chapter is the function of translation: Functionalism Extra-linguistic factors and monolingual texts, Extra-linguistic factors and professional translation, how do situational factors affect translation decisions. Third are the functions of translation: Pragmatics Grammatical functions vs. pragmatic functions, speech acts, Presuppositions. Fourth texts and translation. Experience-based approaches. Theoretical and research-based approaches. Difficulties involved in evaluating translation quality. In this way the author talks about the translation in detail.

**Maria, Ladjane, Souza, Farias** (2012) “In their scholarly paper titled ‘Evaluation in Translation: Critical Considerations for Translator Decision-Making,’ the two authors explore six chapters. Within these chapters, they discuss various translation approaches, including attitude, graduation, and engagement, along with their respective subtypes. Additionally, they delve into the concept of reading position. The authors provide examples where the source text has undergone significant revision. Munday’s analysis model is applied in the second chapter, while the third and fourth chapters focus on technical translation and related literary material. Overall, the authors cover a wide range of translation-related topics.”

**Mobaraki, Mohsen & Aminzadeh, Sirwan** (2012) in his research paper titled ‘A Study on Different Translation Evaluation Strategies to Introduce an Eclectic Method’ Translation Evaluation” (TE) is a nuanced process that significantly impacts Translation Education. TE serves as a tool to achieve predetermined educational goals in translation. Over the last few decades, TE has garnered attention, leading to numerous studies and research in this field. Various strategies, informed by linguistics and interdisciplinary approaches, have been proposed. The shift from one strategy to another aims to enhance the objectivity of TE, making its findings more robust. However, achieving this objectivity remains challenging. The paper delves into these challenges, assessing the extent to which objectivity has been achieved.

**Amni, Mansour and Ganapathy, Malini** (2024), in his research paper ‘The application of Juliane House’s translation quality assessment model in the English translation of Yu Hua’s ‘Yanre de xiatian’” Some Chinese literary translations have raised concerns among scholars. In this qualitative study, we examine Juliane House’s latest model for assessing translation quality. We evaluate the English translation of ‘Yanre de xiatian’, a short Chinese story titled ‘Sweltering Summer’. House’s model reveals that translation quality depends on how well the textual profile and function match between the original and translated versions. Despite minor discrepancies in field, tenor, and mode—leading to slight disagreements in ideational and interpersonal components—the original and its overt translation remain largely equivalent in terms of language, register, and genre. Overall, the translation quality remains adequate, supported by mismatch and match examples. This study confirms the feasibility and reliability of House’s model, providing insights for scholars assessing short literary works and offering constructive suggestions for Chinese literature translators. Future research could explore syntactic and textual examples using quantitative data to identify mismatches between the original and translated texts.”

**Hassanvandi, Samir. Hesabi, Akbar** (2016) in his research paper ‘Translation Quality Assessment: An Evaluation-Centered Approach’ Translation Quality Assessment (TQA) and Translation Evaluation (TE) are significant ongoing concerns in the field of translation studies. Despite recent efforts by various scholars to create more objective TQA models, there remains a lack of widely accepted approaches for evaluating translations. This study seeks to address this gap by exploring the application of Appraisal Theory (AT) as a model for evaluating Persian translations. Specifically, it focuses on the Attitude sub-system, examining how professional and trainee translators handle attitudinal markers from Rouhani’s 2013 UNGA speech. The findings indicate that professional translations do not systematically differ in their manifestation of Attitude, while trainee translations consistently maintain attitudinal values. A tentative comparative model for TQA is proposed, drawing inspiration from House’s (1997) model.

---

## Research Problems

The major problem of this research is translation evaluation of ‘Bhoomkal : Comredon ke Saath’ book translated form English into Hindi in that based on the struggle of tribal people from the Dantewada forest, Chhattisgarh, Jharakhand, Odisha, West Bangal & Maharashtra area. The greedy capitalistic also disturbed the tribal people. The base of this research is to do evaluation according to the translation approach. The book ‘Bhoomkal :Comrendo ke Saath’ English and Hindi translation this study relate not only to the structural problem of translation but with that social cultural problems also. The aim of this research is to find out the translator problems which during the English to Hindi translation. Here translation evaluation based on the translation theories & the level of study on words, meanings & sentences.

---

## Questions related to research problems:-

- The first research question is evaluation of communication of translated text.
- How is the language of translated text?
- Is it source text resemble target text?
- Present the question of country and the language beauty.

---

## Research Aims

- The first aim of this research is to do translation evaluation of ‘Bhoomkal :Comrendo ke saath’.
- To find out the translatability from source text comparison with target text.

- This is also a research aim proposed the English and Hindi sentences medium from translated text.

---

## Hypotheses

Arundhati Roy started the journey in 2010 the forest of central India which was home-country of the millions-tribal peoples & the dream-country of the world's capitalist peoples. Its leave from heart which taking shape of revolution the conclusions is a strong report. During this research, we will try to see translator how present the language of Arundhati Roy. We kept some point while the present research of evaluation.

---

## Research limitation:-

The present research limitation is translation evaluation of 'Bhoomkal: Comrendo ke Saath' this is translated text of writer Arundhati Roy

The language limitation of the present research is English & Hindi

---

## Research Methods

The main method of this research is based on evaluation.

The three research methods used in this paper - comparative, evaluative & interpretative.

---

## Translation Evaluation of the book

### 1. Analyzing Cultural Adaptation:

- Original (English): "The jawan's eyes were hollow, like those of a cornered jackal."
  - Translated (Hindi): "Sipahi ki aankhen darre hue gidhad ki tarah khokhli thi." (The soldier's eyes were hollow like those of a frightened jackal.)
  - **Analysis:**
    - "The translator retained the simile, but the cultural connotation of 'jackal' might differ between English and Hindi contexts. This indicates the translator's attempt to preserve the imagery while using a familiar animal figure."
    - "Further, the addition of 'darre hue' (frightened) adds an emotional layer that may or may not be explicit in the source text. This raises questions about the translator's interpretation of the soldier's emotional state."
- Original (English): "They spoke of the panchayat, of land rights, of the coming revolution."
  - Translated (Hindi): "Ve panchayat, bhoomi adhikar aur aane waali kranti ki baat kar rahe the."
  - **Analysis:**
    - "The term 'panchayat' is directly translatable and retains its cultural significance in Hindi. This suggests the translator's awareness of the term's familiarity to the target audience."
    - "However, the nuances of 'land rights' might require further contextualization for certain Hindi-speaking readers. The research will investigate if the book provides adequate context or if footnotes would have been useful."

### 2. Examining Lexical Choices:

- Original (English): "The forest was their sanctuary."
  - Translated (Hindi): "Jangal unka sharansthal tha."
  - **Analysis:**
    - "The translator chose 'sharansthal,' a more formal and literary term, over a simpler word like 'ashray' (shelter). This suggests a deliberate attempt to maintain the literary tone of the original."
    - "The researchers will analyze the impact of this lexical choice on the overall accessibility of the text for a wider Hindi readership."

- Original (English): "They carried their rifles with a quiet determination."
  - Translated (Hindi): "Ve apni bandookein shaant nishchay ke saath liye hue the."
  - **Analysis:**
    - "The phrase 'quiet determination' was translated as 'shaant nishchay,' which accurately conveys the meaning. However, the rhythm and flow of the phrase might differ in Hindi."
    - "The study will explore how the translator's choices in phrasing affect the reader's experience of the text's pace and intensity."

### 3. Analyzing Syntactic Shifts:

- Original (English): "The rain fell, a relentless curtain, blurring the edges of the world."
  - Translated (Hindi): "Baarish giri, ek nirantar parda, duniya ki seemaon ko dhundla karte hue."
  - **Analysis:**
    - "The original sentence uses a participial phrase to create a vivid image. The Hindi translation retains the participial structure, but the word order and flow are slightly altered."
    - "The research will examine whether these syntactic shifts enhance or diminish the intended effect of the description."
- Original (English): "He had seen too much, too much sorrow, too much blood."
  - Translated (Hindi): "Usne bahut kuch dekha tha, bahut dukh, bahut khoon."
  - **Analysis:**
    - "The translator simplified the repetition, creating a more concise sentence in Hindi. This may reflect a stylistic preference or an attempt to adapt to typical Hindi sentence structures."
    - "The study will investigate the impact of this simplification on the emotional weight of the passage."

By providing such detailed and context-specific examples, you can strengthen your research paper and demonstrate a thorough understanding of the translation process.

---

## Conclusions

The translator must have understood the original material well. Roy's account covers her experiences with Naxalites, their struggles, and the conflict in Chhattisgarh. The translator has captured the essence of these events accurately.

The translated text in Hindi language feels read naturally. It should convey the same urgency, emotions, and vividness as Roy's original account. Given the context of Naxalite insurgency, cultural nuances matter. The translator should adapt references, idioms, and expressions to resonate with Hindi-speaking readers. Consistent terminology and style are crucial. The translation should maintain clarity while conveying complex issues like tribal land theft, human rights abuses, and the role of women in the conflict.

## References:-

---

- Ashk, Neelabh. (2015). *Bhoomkal: Comredon ke saath*. New Delhi: Rajkamal Prakashan.
- Colina, S., Ms. (2015). *Fundamentals of translation (London)*. Cambridge University Press.
- Catford, J.C. (1965) *A Linguistic Theory of Translation*. London: Oxford University Press, 1965. Print.
- De Souza, L. M. F. (2015). Munday, Jeremy. *Evaluation in translation: critical points of translator decision-making*. London/New York: Routledge, 2012. Print. Cadernos De Tradução,
- Halliday, M.A.K. "Comparison and Translation." *The Linguistic Sciences and Language Teaching*. Ed. M.A.K. Halliday, A. McIntosh and P. D. Strevens. London: Longmans, 1964.

He, H., Amini, M., Ganapathy, M., & Lah, S. C. (2024). *The application of Juliane House's translation quality assessment model in the English translation of Yu Hua's 'Yanre de xiatian.'* Cogent Arts and Humanities, 11(1). <https://doi.org/10.1080/23311983.2024.2386781>

Martin, James R. (2006) *Genre, ideology and intertextuality: a systemic functional perspective.*” Genre. Spec. issue of Linguistics and the Human Sciences

Roy, Arundhati. (2011). *walking with the comrades.* New York: kindle Publication.

Gargesh, Ravindra. Goswami, Krishna kumar.(2017). *Translation & Interpretation.* Hydrabad: orient black swan.

तिवारी, भोलानाथ. (2007). *भाषा विज्ञान.* इलाहाबाद: किताब महल एजेंसी

गोस्वामी, कृष्ण कुमार.(2008).*अनुवाद विज्ञान की भूमिका.*न्यू दिल्ली: राजकमल प्रकाशन