WWW.IJRPR.COM

International Journal of Research Publication and Reviews

Journal homepage: www.ijrpr.com ISSN 2582-7421

GOVERNMENT EXPENDITURE AND SECURITY REQUIREMENT FOR ACHIEVING SUSTAINABLE ECONOMIC GROWTH AND DEVELOPMENT (1994-2020)

Ezeala George[1], Obi Joseph O.[2], Afolalu Anthony Buyide[3]

[1]Department of Accountancy, Nnamdi Azikiwe University, Awka, Mail: ezeala.g@unizik.edu.ng
[2]Department of Accountancy, Federal Polytechnic, Oko, Mail: 64obisom@gmail.com
[3]Bursary Department, Federal Polytechnic, Ado-Ekiti, Nigeria: mail afolalubuyide@yahoo.com

ABSTRACT

Government expenditure on defence and internal security has been on the increase in the last few decades making it vital to look at it's impact on the growth and development of the economy. The study assessed the impact Government expenditure on defence and internal security as necessary for achieving sustainable economic growth and development in Nigeria. The study used time series data, from 1994-2020. The issue of security, has become a serious threat to sustainable development in any economy and it has become a great concern in view of its escalating trend. The objective of the study is to determine the impact of government expenditure on defence and internal security on economic growth and development in Nigeria. The data employed were sourced from Central Bank of Nigeria publications and World Bank World Development Indicators (WDI). The study anchored on progressive theory of public expenditure The dependent variables for the study are economic growth proxy by real gross domestic product (RGDP) and economic development proxy by Human development index(HDI) while the independent variables are recurrent government expenditure on defence and internal security . The data were analysed using Analysis of Variance (ANOVA) to ascertain the impact of government recurrent expenditure on defence and internal security on economic growth and development at 0.05% level of significance for significance determination. The findings revealed that the impact of government recurrent expenditure on defence and internal security on RGDP and HDI is significant within the period under review. Therefore, the study recommends that government should invest more on defence and security and also design a device to ensure all the expenditures on Security and defence are considered guardedly as to consolidate on the gains realized so far.

Keywords: *Recurrent Expenditure, Internal Security, Defence, Economic Growth, Sustainable economic development*

1. INTRODUCTION

Government expenditure on Defence and Internal security is a major concern of many countries' financial plan. It also differs depending on countries' security concerns and requirements for dealing with challenges they face both internally and externally. The role of government in an economy cannot be over-emphasized in protecting the society from the violence and invasion of other independent societies and protect every member of the society from the oppression of every member of it through a strong military mechanism, involving robust commitments to defence expenditure in order to strengthen security and counter threats. (Galvin, 2003). Security spending is alienated into internal security expenditure and defence expenditure. Internal security expenditure refers to the cost incurred on the protection of citizens, properties and infrastructure by security agencies such as the police, civil defence corps, department of state security, prisons service, etc. Defence expenditure as well covers that segment of government spending on the acquisition and maintenance of military hardware, intelligence, research-development and payment of armed forces (Army, Navy and Airforce) salaries and other government agencies such as the NIA (National Intelligence Agency). Principally, the government has been lumbered with two major functions of ensuring that the law and order are maintained and making available the desired social infrastructure. But these activities have taken a different shift in this modern time to include ensuring there are economic growth and development (Ofanson, 2007).

Nigeria as a nation is presently passing through some dreadful challenges in the area of insecurity. Sixty-one years after independence, the security mode of the country has remained unchanged, the peace and security challenges have principally not been addressed, with several issues transforming into huge insecurity problems with uncomplimentary consequences that is affecting the economic activities. Particularly in this present era of democratic dispensation, new forms of violent crimes have become common; these include kidnapping for ransom, pipeline vandalization, Boko Haram bombings, rape, political violence and more, which have affected the Nigerian economy adversely.

Historical data shows that internal security and defence spending increased tremendously from 1999 immediately the democratic governance came on track. Increased security spending was also informed by rising sectarian and ethno-religious crises, rampant kidnappings for ransom, hostage taking of oil company workers, crude oil pipelines and oil installations vandalism, ritual killings among others (Peterside, 2014).

The effect of national security spending on economic growth and development, especially in Nigeria is not clear and therefore its impact on gross domestic product (GDP) and economic development is crucial. Furthermore, most studies on defence-growth relationship focus more on external defence, however, the security challenges in Nigeria are more of internal insecurity. Therefore, this study focuses on government expenditure on internal security and external defence and its impact on economic growth and development in Nigeria. Based on the background, it is therefore imperative to examine empirically the impact of government security expenditure(defence and internal security) on economic growth in Nigeria.

To achieve this, specific objectives are to:

i. Examine the impact of government recurrent expenditure on defence, on economic growth in Nigeria.
ii. Evaluate the impact of government recurrent expenditure on internal security, on economic growth in Nigeria.
iii. Determine the impact of government recurrent expenditure on defence, on economic development in Nigeria.
iv. Assess the impact of government recurrent expenditure on internal security, on economic development in Nigeria

The subsequent sections are structured as follows: section two discusses the relevant literature reviews. Section three presents the methodology and data. Section four presents data analysis and discussion of findings. Finally, section five deals with the conclusion and recommendations.

2. CONCEPTUAL LITERATURE

National security:

National security is the ability to preserve the nation's physical integrity and territory; to maintain its economic relations with the rest of the world on reasonable terms; to preserve its nature, institution, and governance from disruption from outside; and to control its borders." (Brown, 1983) "National security is best described as a capacity to control those domestic and foreign conditions that the public opinion of a given community believes necessary to enjoy its own self-determination or autonomy, prosperity, and wellbeing." (Maier, 1990)

Military Expenditure:

Military Expenditure According to Wikipedia, military expenditure also known as a defence budget, it is the amount of financial resources dedicated by a state to raising and maintaining an armed forces or other methods essential for defence purposes. Military budgets often reflect how strongly a country perceives the likelihood of threats against it, or the amount of aggression it wishes to conjure. It also gives an idea of how much financing should be provided for the upcoming fiscal year. Factors that determine a defence budget include the size of that country's economy.

Internal Security Expenditure:

Security spending includes the payment of the salaries of armed forces personnel, thus enabling them to take care of their basic needs (Beijer, 2010). The security spending also encompasses medical services, education and training of both local and foreign security personnel as well as research and development. The bulk of security spending is on the procurement of materials and equipment such as ammunitions of all categories. While, National security and defense can be understood as preparedness for military action, protection of resources considered critical to the functioning of a nation to protect a country from attack or subversion (Otto and Ukpere, 2012).

Economic growth:

Economic growth can be defined as an increase in the value of goods and services produced by economy overtime. It is conventionally mentioned as the percent rate of increase in real gross domestic products, or real GDP. Growth is usually calculated in real terms, i.e. inflation adjusted terms; in other obviate the distorting effect of inflation on the prices of goods and services produced. In economics, “economic growth” or “economic growth theory typically refers to the potential output. (Omojimite, 2012).

Human Capital Development:

The concept of human capital formulation, according to, Adawo (2011) refers to a conscious and continuous process of acquiring and increasing the number of people with requisite knowledge, education, skills, and experience that are crucial for the economic development of a country. Obisi & Anyim (2012), also noted that human capital development are talents, skills, competencies and other advantages which people possess, and could be put to better use to give organization and nations more benefits. However, it is important to note that the higher human capital of a society is the higher would be the potentials for economic development.

Conceptually, the present study shall be based on the fact that while governments try to reallocate their military expenditure to essential human needs with the aim of improving the human capital factor of a country, it has to be done in such a manner as not to make either of the two suffer disproportionately since security guarantees a stable political and economic climate that engenders growth of the domestic economy. (Alugbuo and Uremadu. 2020)

3. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

The Progressive Theory of Public Expenditures:

The theory was adopted by an American writer and public finance analyst. The progressive theory by Mabel Walker was one of the earliest attempts to develop a positive budget theory. Walker intends to provide theory to aid in decisions for allocation of government expenditures. Mabel Walker (1937) reviews the theories of public expenditure and devises a method for ascertaining the tendencies in distribution of expenditures on the assumption that the way would be pointed to "a norm of expenditures that is consistent with the state of progress at present achieved by society" (Key, 1987).

4. EMPIRICAL REVIEW

In an attempt of determining the impact of government expenditure on defence and internal security on economic growth and development, many scholars have carried out related studies from which few are reviewed in an attempt of finding a solution to our research problem. Such scholars include;

Laniran & Ajala (2021) explored the relationship between military expenditure and economic growth in Nigeria using annual time series data from 1981 – 2017. The autoregressive distributed lag (ARDL) estimation technique was used in testing the relationship between the variables in the model. The result of the study shows that there is a significant positive long-run relationship between military expenditure and economic growth. Amana, Aigbedion & Zubair(2020) Assessed the impact of government security expenditure on economic growth in Nigeria from 1986-2018. The study was carried out using time series data, and econometrics tools were used for testing and estimation. Augmented Dickey-Fuller (ADF) was used to test the stationarity, the Ordinary Least Square (OLS) and Error Correction Model (ECM) techniques were used to estimate the impact of government security expenditure on economic growth in Nigeria. The study revealed that all the independent variables were statistically insignificant.

Taheer & Asmau (2017) studied the effects of defense and health expenditures on Economic growth in Nigeria from 1970 to 2015. The Error Correction Mechanism (ECM) and Granger Causality methods were methods of analysis used in the estimation of the models. Among other findings, the result of the ECM model shows that defense spending has positive and statistically significant impact on the Nigerian economy in the short run. The Granger causality result also revealed a unidirectional causality running from DSP to GDP but not the other way around.

Ismail (2017) examined the relationship between military expenditure and economic growth in five South Asian countries from 1988 – 2013 using panel data. Their result indicates a positive effect of military expenditure on economic growth. Phiri (2016) using the logistic smooth transition regression (LSTR) model explored a non-linear relationship between military spending, economic growth and other determinants for the South African economy using time series data from 1988 – 2014. His findings indicated an inverted U shaped relationship between military spending and economic growth.

The work of Mohammed & Lawong (2016), examined the impact of insecurity on selected macroeconomic variables using dynamic modeling approach to analyze time series data for the period 1960-2014. Findings indicate the existence of a long run relationship between arms import, our measure of insecurity, and the variables considered. Korkmaz (2015) studied the effect of military spending on economic growth and unemployment in Mediterranean countries from 2005 – 2012, using panel data analysis. His findings showed that military spending affect economic growth of countries negatively while increasing unemployment. Khalid and Mustapha (2014) examined the effects of military spending on economic growth in India using annual data from the period of 1980 to 2011. In their paper, the autoregressive distributive lags (ARDL) co integration approach was used to reexamine the long-run relationships among the variables. The results for ARDL tests indicate that there is a significant relationship between military spending and economic growth in the short run, while the long run results suggest otherwise.

Apansile & Okunlola (2014) examined the effect of military spending on output in Nigeria both in the short-run and in the long-run period. Using ARDL bounds testing approach to co-integration. Results showed that military spending has negative and significant effect on output in the short-run but positive and significant effect in the long-run. Labour and capital have positive and significant effects both in the long-run and short-run. Oriavwote & Eshenake (2013) used Error Correction Model and found out that the expenditure on defence has a negative impact on the level of economic growth. Though, with an indication of defective expenditure budgeting and implementation in the defense sector, expenditure on internal security played important role in generating the desired level of economic growth in Nigeria. Pradhan, Arvin, Norman & Bhinder (2013) in their study on military expenditure and economic growth using a dynamic multivariate causality tests applied to data from 22 countries for the period 1988–2012. Their findings revealed equilibrium relationships between military expenditure and economic growth.

Olofin (2012) examined the relationship between the components of defense spending and poverty reduction in Nigeria between 1990 and 2010. Four models were estimated using Dynamic Ordinary Least Square (DOLS) method, two in which poverty index constructed from human development indicators serves as dependent variable and the others in which infant mortality rate serves as dependent variable. The result shows that military expenditure per soldier, military participation rate, trade, population and output per capita square were positively related to poverty indicator and, military expenditure, secondary school enrolment and output per capita were negatively related to poverty level.

In the work of Otto & Ukpere (2012) which was carried out by examining the impact of national security on growth. The work observes that there is a positive relationship between security and development in accordance with literature. Tiwari & Shahbaz (2011) studied the effect of defense spending on economic growth using ARDL bounds testing approach. They found out that there is long run relationship between the variables, and there is also a positive effect of the defense spending on economic growth. Furthermore, there study also showed that there is bidirectional causal relationship between defense spending and economic growth using variance decomposition approach.

Anyanwu (2011) analysed defence spending and economic growth in Nigeria within the Vector Error Correction model, the study found a positive relationship between military expenditure and economic growth in the long and short run. Enimola and Akoko (2011) examined the relationship between the level of economic growth and defense spending in the case of Nigeria from the period of 1977 to 2006. The result of the Granger causality test shows that there is a unidirectional causality running from economic growth to defense spending.

5. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This study seeks to examine the impact of government expenditure on defence and internal security on economic growth and development in Nigeria. The nature of data for this research works is secondary data and they were obtained from CBN statistical bulletin for various years and World Bank development indicators.

The variables used in this study were broadly categorized into dependent and independent variables. The dependent variables include the economic growth proxy by real gross domestic Product and economic development proxy by human development index. On the other hand, the independent variables are government expenditure on defence and internal security. The study uses Analysis of Variance (ANOVA) to ascertain the impact of government recurrent expenditure on defence and internal security on economic growth and development Nigeria from 1994 to 2020.

Model Specification:

The study adapted the model of Amana, Aigbedion & Zubair (2020) who examined the impact of government expenditure on economic growth in Nigeria. The model was stated as;

RGDP = f (GRDEXP, GRISEXP, GSCAEXP)

Where;

RGDP = Real Gross Domestic Product

GRDDEXP = Government recurrent defence spending

GRISEXP = Government recurrent internal security spending

GSCAEXP = Government security capital spending

Therefore the models for this study is given below

RGDP = *f*((DEF)

RGDP = *f*((SEC)

HDI = *f* (DEF)

HDI = *f*(SEC)

While the econometrics form of the models were written as;

$RGDP = \alpha_0 + \alpha_1 DEF + \alpha_2 SEC + \mu_t$

$HDI = \alpha_0 + \alpha_1 DEF + \alpha_2 SEC + \mu_t$

Where;

RGDP = Gross Domestic Product

HDI=Human Development Index

DEF=Government recurrent expenditure on defence

SEC= Government recurrent expenditure on internal security

Instruments for Data Analysis:

The formulated hypotheses were tested using the probability values (p-values) of the F-statistic of Analysis of Variance (ANOVA). This is used to show the significance impact on the chosen level of significance is 5%.

Data analysis, Result and Discussion

Test of Hypothesis 1

H0: Government recurrent expenditure on defence has no significant impact on economic growth in Nigeria.

Model Summary[b]

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	.903[a]	.815	.808	8194.23401

a. Predictors: (Constant), DEFENCE

b. Dependent Variable: RGDP

ANOVA[a]

Model		Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1	Regression	7407925305.010	1	7407925305.010	110.327	.000[b]
	Residual	1678636773.733	25	67145470.949		
	Total	9086562078.743	26			

a. Dependent Variable: RGDP

b. Predictors: (Constant), DEFENCE

Coefficients[a]

Model		Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	T	Sig.
		B	Std. Error	Beta		
1	(Constant)	28677.627	2242.562		12.788	.000
	DEFENCE	94.488	8.996	.903	10.504	.000

a. Dependent Variable: RGDP

Source: computer output using SPSS

Test of hypothesis 2

H0: Government recurrent expenditure on internal security has no significant impact on economic growth in Nigeria.

Model Summary[b]

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	.930[a]	.865	.860	7003.35728

a. Predictors: (Constant), SECURITY

b. Dependent Variable: GDP

ANOVA[a]

Model		Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1	Regression	7860386750.399	1	7860386750.399	160.262	.000[b]
	Residual	1226175328.344	25	49047013.134		
	Total	9086562078.743	26			

a. Dependent Variable: RGDP

b. Predictors: (Constant), SECURITY

Coefficients[a]

Model		Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	T	Sig.
		B	Std. Error	Beta		
1	(Constant)	27053.951	1980.516		13.660	.000
	SECURITY	87.940	6.947	.930	12.659	.000

Dependent Variable: RGDP

Source: computer output using SPSS

Test of hypothesis 3

H0: Government recurrent expenditure on defence has no significant impact on economic development in Nigeria.

Model Summary[b]

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	.936[a]	.877	.872	.01121

a. Predictors: (Constant), DEFENCE

b. Dependent Variable: HDI

ANOVA[a]

Model		Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1	Regression	.022	1	.022	177.502	.000[b]
	Residual	.003	25	.000		
	Total	.025	26			

a. Dependent Variable: HDI

b. Predictors: (Constant), DEFENCE

Coefficients[a]

Model		Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	T	Sig.
		B	Std. Error	Beta		
1	(Constant)	.466	.003		151.848	.000
	DEFENCE	.000	.000	.936	13.323	.000

Dependent Variable: HDI

Source: computer output using SPSS

Test of hypothesis 4

H0: Government recurrent expenditure on internal security has no significant impact on economic development in Nigeria.

Model Summary[b]

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	.963[a]	.927	.925	.00859

a. Predictors: (Constant), SECURITY

b. Dependent Variable: HDI

NOVA[a]

Model		Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1	Regression	.024	1	.024	319.786	.000[b]
	Residual	.002	25	.000		
	Total	.025	26			

a. Dependent Variable: HDI

b. Predictors: (Constant), SECURITY

Coefficients[a]

Model		Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	T	Sig.
		B	Std. Error	Beta		
1	(Constant)	.463	.002		190.607	.000
	SECURITY	.000	.000	.963	17.883	.000

6. DISCUSSION OF RESULTS

Each of null hypotheses 1, 2, 3 and 4 have adjusted R squares of more than 0.5 (that is 0.808, 0.860, 0.872 and 0.925 respectively) as shown in the model summaries above. Taking the models one by one, this indicates that each model is effective enough to determine the relationship between the response and explanatory variables. This position, again for each hypothesis, is corroborated by the F- ratio of value of more than 1 (that is 110.327, 160.262, 177.502 and 319.786 respectively) in each of the null hypothesis test result from the ANOVA indicating efficient models.

From the ANOVA table, p – value of 0.000 for the null hypothesis 1 showed significant impact. This position was further confirmed by the Sig – value of 0.000 obtained from the coefficients. Similar results were obtained for hypotheses 2, 3 and 4 as depicted by ANOVA and Coefficient columns in the table above. For hypothesis 2, 3 and 4 each have p- values of 0.000 from the ANOVA indicating significant impact and supported by Sig-values of 0.000 each shown in each of the coefficient tables indicating that the independent variables are having some significant impact on their respective dependent variables.

7. CONCLUSION

Based on the findings as shown above, we hereby conclude on hypothesis one that government expenditure on defense has significant impact on the economic growth within the period of this study. Also on hypothesis two the government expenditure on internal security has significant impact on the economic growth within the same period. This is in tandem with similar research by Amana, Aigbedion & Zubair (2020) who assessed the impact of government security expenditure on economic growth in Nigeria from 1986-2018 and concluded that government expenditure on security has some significant effect on national economy. Similaly, Taheer & Asmau (2017) also concluded, after examining the effect of defense and health expenditures on Economic growth in Nigeria from 1970 to 2015, found that government expenditure on defence has significant impact on economic growth of the nation.

Result on hypothesis three showed that there is significant impact of government expenditure on defense on the living standard of citizens. Similarly, hypothesis four test results showed that expenditure on internal security has some significance impact on the living standard of the citizens. Finally, we conclude that government expenditure on internal security has significant impact on the economic development and also on the standard of living of the citizens.

Recommendation:

The study recommends that government should allocate more funds on defence and security and also design a device to ensure all the expenditures on Security and defence are considered guardedly as to consolidate on the gains already made towards economic growth and human development . We also recommend that funds allocated for external defence and internal security are monitored with a view of ensuring that they are used specifically for that purpose and not committed to other use.

REFERENCES

[1] Adawo, M. A. (2011). Has education human capital contributed to the economic growth of Nigeria. Journal of Economics and International Finance, 3 (1), 46-58.

[2] Alugbuo, J. & Uremadu, S.(2020). Effect Of Military expenditure on human capital Development in Nigeria An ARDL model approach. Journal of Multidisciplinary Engineering Science and Technology,7(6).

[3] Amana,S., Aigbedion, I. & Zubair, A.(2020). Impact of Government Security Expenditure on Economic Growth in Nigeria. International Journal of Innovative Research in Social Sciences and Strategic Management Techniques,7(1).

[4] Anyanwu, S. (2011). Defence expenditure and economic growth in Nigeria: A Vector Error Correction Model (VECM) approach. Asia Journal of Empirical Research, 1(2).

[5] Apanisile, O. T.& Okunlola, O. C. (2014). An empirical analysis of effects of military spending on economic growth in Nigeria: A bound testing approach to co-integration 1989- 2013. Journal of Public Administration, Finance and Law, 3(6), 117-130.

[6] Beijer, M. (2010). Economic and social rights and the prospects of conflict prevention and peace building in Africa, J.A.L. 47.

[7] Brown, J. (1983). Thinking about national security: defense and foreign policy in a dangerous world. As quoted in Watson, Cynthia Ann (2008). U.S. national security: a reference handbook. Contemporary world issues (2 (revised) .

[8] Central Bank of Nigeria. Statistical Bulletin. (2021).

[9] Enimola, S.S. & Akoko, A.(2011). Defense expenditure and economic growth: The Nigerian Experience: 1977-2006. Botswana Journal of Economics, 8(12), 26-44.

[10] Galvin, H. (2003). The impact of defence spending on the economic growth of developing countries: A cross section study. Defence and Peace Economics,14 (1), 51-5

[11] Ismail, S. (2017) "Military Expenditure and Economic Growth in South Asian Countries: Empirical Evidences." International Journal of Economics and Financial Issues, 7 (3), 318–25.

[12] Key, V.O. (1987). "The Lack of a Budgetary Theory." In J.M. Shafritz and A.C. Hyde (eds.), Classics of Public Administration, 2nd ed. Reprinted from American Political Science Review. Chicago: Dorsey Press, 1987:116–122.

[13] Khalid, M & Mustapha, B. (2014). Military expenditure and economic growth in the case of China: using ARDL approach. International Journal of Development and Emerging Economics. 2 (1), 27-36.

[14] Korkmaz, S. (2015). "The Effect of Military Spending on Economic Growth and Unemployment." International Journal of Economics and Financial Issues, 5 (1), 273–80.

[15] Laniran, T.J. & Ajala, O. (2021). Military expenditure and economic growth: Evidence from Nigeria. American Journal of Economics, 11(1), 10-18.

[16] Maier, (1990) Peace and security for the 1990s. Unpublished paper for the MacArthur Fellowship Program, Social Science Research Council, 12 Jun 1990.

[17] Mohammed, S. & Lawong, D. (2016). An Analysis of the Macroeconomic Impact of Insecurity on Nigeria: A Dynamic Modeling Approach. Journal of Social and Management Sciences,2 (1), 1-11.

[18] Obisi, C. & Anyim, F. C. (2012). Developing the human capital for entrepreneurship challenges and successes. International journal of academic research in business and social sciences, 2(3), 128-134.

[19] Ofanson E. J. (2007), Public Sector Finance. Bobpeco Publishers, Benin City.

[20] Oriavwote, E. V. & Eshenake, S. J. (2013). A vector error correction modeling of security spending and economic growth in Nigeria, Accounting and Finance Research. 2 (2).

[21] Otto, G. & Ukpere, W. I. (2012). National security and development in Nigeria, African Journal of Business Management. 6 (23), 6765-677

[22] Peterside, Z. B. (2014).The Military and Internal Security in Nigeria: Challenges and Prospects. Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences, 5(27) , 1301-1307.

[23] Phiri, A. (2017). Does military spending nonlinearly affect economic growth in South Africa? Defence and Peace Economics, 28, 1–14.

[24] Pradhan, R.P., Arvin, M.B., Norman, N.R. & Bhinder, H.K. (2013). Military Expenditure and Economic Growth: Using Causality, Cointegration and Missing Variables. International Journal of Computational Economics and Econometrics, 3(3), 164-186.

[25] Taheer, A. & Asmau, Y. (2017). Regression analysis of health and defense expenditure on economic growth in Nigeria. International Journal of Peace and Conflict Studies (IJPCS), 4(2),53-64.

[26] Tiwari, A.K. & Shahbaz, M. (2013). Does defence spending stimulate economic growth in India? Defence and Peace Economics, 24(4), 371-395.

[27] Walker, M. (1920). Municipal Expenditures and Progressive Budget Theory. Best Practices and Mode. Sage Publications.

[28] Walker, M. (1937). Progressive Public Expenditures Budget Theory. Sage Publications.Wikipedia (2021)

[29] World Bank (2021). World development report.